

Long-Term Structural and Functional Brain Imaging Findings in American Football Players: Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis

Andrew Dominic Legarreta BA; Aashim Bhatia MD, MS; Steve Hubert Monk BA; Paul Kirby BS; Benjamin L Brett; Aaron Michael Yengo-Kahn MD; Gary Solomon PhD; Scott L. Zuckerman MD

Vanderbilt Sports Concussion Center; Department of Neurology, Medical College of Wisconsin; Department of Neurosurgery, Medical College of Wisconsin; Department of Neurological Surgery, Vanderbilt University Medical Center; Department of Radiology and Radiological Sciences, Vanderbilt



Introduction

- Lasting neurocognitive deficits after participation in football is a growing public health concern.
- Brain imaging studies have suggested that long-term neuroanatomical changes occur in football athletes, but the clinical importance of these findings remains unknown.
- Our objective was to summarize the brain imaging studies after long-term SRC in American football players.

Methods

- A systematic review was performed with the following inclusion criteria: football players, brain imaging at least 2 years from prior concussion or retirement, and sample size >5.
- Studies were assessed for methodology (selection of controls, type I error, recall bias, and baseline imaging) and imaging outcomes.
- Proportion tests were used to assess which methodologies were likely to lead to positive results.

Results

- Sixteen studies (all cross-sectional studies) met inclusion criteria.
- Highest level of play was high school (1), college (3), and professional (12).
- Thirteen of the 16 studies made a total 456 comparisons of brain activity, of which 171 were statistically significant (38%).
- Nine of 16 studies (56%) had appropriate controls.
- Five of 16 studies (31%) had appropriate control of type I error.
- All studies (16/16) had recall bias when obtaining player concussion history or had unclear methodology.
- Imaging outcome measures included patterns of connectivity on functional MRI (fMRI) (25%), metabolic changes on 1H-MR spectroscopy (6.3%), and white matter changes on diffusion tensor (DTI) imaging (31.2%).
- Zero of 16 studies (0%) had baseline imaging performed.

Conclusions

- Studies of long-term structural and functional brain imaging findings in American football players are heterogeneous in both methodology and findings.
- Understanding the clinical significance of statistically positive findings is complicated by methodological limitations and study design.
- Further research is required to correlate imaging findings with clinical outcomes.

References

1. Manley G, Gardner AJ, Schneider KJ, Guskiewicz KM, Bailes J, Cantu RC, et al. A systematic review of potential long-term effects of sport-related concussion. Br J Sports Med. 2017;51:969-77.
2. Strain JF, Womack KB, Didehbani N, Spence JS, Conover H, Hart J, Jr., et al. Imaging Correlates of Memory and Concussion History in Retired National Football League Athletes. JAMA neurology. 2015;72:773-80.
3. Feddermann-Demont N, Echemendia RJ, Schneider KJ, Solomon GS, Hayden KA, Turner M, et al. What domains of clinical function should be assessed after sport-related concussion? A systematic review. Br J Sports Med. 2017;51:903-18.

